## BEFORE THE JUDICIAL PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION

|                                | : |                |
|--------------------------------|---|----------------|
| In Re: DuPont Teflon Consumer  | : |                |
| <b>Class Action Litigation</b> | : |                |
|                                | : | MDL Docket No. |

## MOTION OF CLASS ACTION PLAINTIFFS FOR COORDINATED OR CONSOLIDATED PRE-TRIAL PROCEEDINGS IN A SINGLE DISTRICT

This motion involves a series of class actions filed in jurisdictions across the country which seek relief arising from Defendant E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company's ("DuPont") wrongful conduct related to the manufacture, advertising and sale for over fifty years of its product commonly known as "Teflon." The plaintiffs contend that cooking products containing DuPont's Teflon can release harmful and dangerous substances, including a chemical that has been determined to be likely to cause cancer in humans.

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1407 and Rule 10 of the Rules of Procedure of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation, plaintiffs in the action styled <u>Natalie Belmont</u>, <u>Sharon Berenfeld</u>, <u>M.D., Monica Martucci</u>, <u>Nicole M. Suri</u>, <u>Mirna Hormechea</u>, <u>Janet Brill</u>, <u>Ph.D.</u>, <u>Sylvia Moss</u>, <u>Lewis Estevez</u>, <u>Melissa Zacharias</u>, <u>Ignacio Martinez</u>, <u>Rick Romash</u>, <u>Briditte Romash</u>, <u>Lillian</u>

Chasin and Carmen Finol v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 05-21921, U.S.D.C. S.D. Fl. (Gold, J.) ("Movants"), for themselves and on behalf of each of the plaintiffs in the actions identified in the attached Schedule "A" (the "Related Actions"), respectfully move this Panel for an order transferring all related pending actions against DuPont, and any and all additional related actions that may be brought to the attention of the Panel, to the United States District Court for the Southern District of Florida, or another district, which the Panel deems to be the most convenient forum, for coordinated or consolidated pretrial proceedings.

As set forth below and in the accompanying Memorandum of Law, the Related Actions and the other actions referenced herein satisfy the requirements for consolidation or coordination because they concern common questions of fact and consolidation or coordination will serve both efficiency and convenience.

In support of their motion, Movants aver that:

- 1. Movants are plaintiffs in: <u>Natalie Belmont, Sharon Berenfeld, M.D., Monica Martucci, Nicole M. Suri, Mirna Hormechea, Janet Brill, Ph.D., Sylvia Moss, Lewis Estevez, Melissa Zacharias, Ignacio Martinez, Rick Romash, Briditte Romash, Lillian Chasin and Carmen Finol v. E.I. <u>DuPont DeNemours & Company</u>, No. 05-21921, U.S.D.C. S.D. Fl. (Gold, J.), ("the Florida Action").</u>
- 2. Movants have brought the Florida Action seeking to represent a class of Florida citizens under Florida's consumer protection laws, among other causes of action.
- 3. Counsel for Movants are aware of the following Related Actions containing substantially the same allegations, seeking substantially the same relief against the same defendant, under the consumer protection or other laws of the state in which the actions were

filed, and involving the same lead counsel in the Florida action as co-counsel in each Related Action:

Kathleen Margay and Dorie Talotta v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 2:05-CV-4049, U.S.D.C. E.D. Pa. (Katz, J.);

<u>Lisa Howe, Melissa Ochiro, Dianne Walton and Maria Sprowl v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. CV05-5488, U.S.D.C. C.D. Ca. (Pregerson, J.);</u>

Jerry Syntych, Belinda Luquetta, Theresa Scott, Ruth Garcia, Tracey R. Ferguson, John Bums, Monica Ceballos, Kimberly Cowart, Gary Swartz, Maria Quinteros, Ruby Black v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. H 05-2530, U.S.D.C. S.D. Tx. (Werlein, J.);

Susan E. Schnur v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 1: 05-CV-1818, U.S.D.C. N.D. Oh. (Polster, J.);

Rosemarie Compitello, Jeannie Triolo, Robin Belodoff, Gary Frechter, Gracie Triolo, and Betty Muehlgay v. E1 DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 05-CV-6749, U.S.D.C. S.D.NY. (Casey, J.);

Sheldon B Lyke, Dorothy M. Jones and Romuald C. Warkomski v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 05-CV-4168, U.S.D.C. N.D. Ill. (Aspen, J.);

Constance A. Webb v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 2:05-CV-72923, U.S.D.C. E.D. Mi. (Edmunds, J.);

Susan R. Yoshioka v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 05-CV-1440, U.S.D.C. Co. (Figa, J.);

<u>Judy Levin v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company</u>, No. 05-11618-WGY, U.S.D.C. Ma. (Young, J.); and

Heath Hutchison, Sima Granat, Ashley Granat, Kim Kraus, Joseph Bales, Betty Baird, Mike Kessler, Connie Matthews, Tina Stoggsdill, Mary Fritz v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 4-05-CV-01234-ERW, U.S.D.C. E.D. Mo. (Webber, J.)

Melissa Lee Urch and Claire R. Brown v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 7: 05-CV-02438 U.S.D.C. S.C. (Harwell, J.)

Each of the Plaintiffs in the foregoing cases listed in Schedule "A" joins in this motion.

4. In addition to the Related Actions, Movants are aware of class actions filed in the Southern District of California captioned <u>Jennifer Hardee v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & E</u>

Company, No. 05-CV-1522, S.D. Cal. (Storms, M.J) and in the Southern District of Iowa captioned Janet R. Luett, Shellie Johnson, Michelle Bridgeman, Wendee Larson, Kari Elbert and Dixie Radke v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 4:05-CV-00422, U.S.D.C. S.D. Ia. (Longstaff, J.); which raise substantially the same allegations as those in the Related Actions. Movants' counsel advises the Panel that they are unaware of the Plaintiffs' position on the relief requested in this Motion. These actions are listed in Schedule "B."

- 5. In each of the actions referenced above, plaintiffs have brought claims against DuPont seeking certification of state-wide classes, alleging, inter alia, that DuPont failed to warn purchasers and users that cooking products containing DuPont's "Teflon" product contained potentially harmful and dangerous substances which can be released when the Teflon-coated cooking products were used for their intended purpose. The complaints (and amended complaints) filed in each of the actions identified in this Motion contain essentially the same allegations concerning the dangerous propensities of Teflon, DuPont's knowledge of those dangerous propensities, its failure to warn purchaser and users of Teflon-coated cooking products of those dangerous propensities, and injury to the class.
- 6. Discovery conducted in each of the actions proposed for consolidation or coordination will be substantially similar, if not identical, and will involve the same or similar documents and witnesses, since each action arises from the same operative facts related to DuPont's wrongful conduct related to the manufacture, advertising and sale of Teflon-coated cooking products.
- 7. Absent transfer of all of these cases to a single forum for coordinated and consolidated pretrial proceedings, there is a substantial risk of inconsistent and conflicting pretrial rulings.

- 8. Transfer of these actions to one District would serve the convenience of the parties and witnesses, and would promote the just and efficient conduct of this litigation.
- 9. For the reasons set forth in the accompanying Memorandum of Law, which Movants incorporate by reference, Movants submit that, when taking into consideration the relevant factors in selecting an appropriate transferee forum under 28 U.S.C. δ 1407 and Rule 10 of the Rules of Procedure of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation, the Southern District of Florida is the district court which is best suited to manage these proceedings.

WHEREFORE, Movants respectfully request that the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation enter an Order consolidating or coordinating all pretrial proceedings, including but not limited to class certification discovery and hearing, in the actions identified herein, together with any similar actions subsequently filed, to the United States District Court for the Southern District of Florida.

Dated: October 12, 2005

Respectfully submitted,

KLUGER, PERETZ, KAPLAN & BERLIN, P.L.

Attorneys for Movants

Miami Center, Seventeenth Floor

201 South Biscayne Boulevard

Miami, Florida 33131

Telephone: (305) 379-9000

Facsimile:)(305) 379-3428

Alan J. Kluger

Alan J. Kiuger

Fla. Bar No. 200379

akluger@kpkb.com

Steve I. Silverman

Fla. Bar No. 516831

ssilverman@kpkb.com

Stuart R. Silver

Fla. Bar No. 184237

ssilver@kpkb.com

- and -

Oppenheim & Pilelsky, P.A. 2500 Weston Road, Suite 404 Weston, Florida 33331 Roy Oppenheim Fla. Bar No. 710016 roy@gate.net

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served via U.S. Mail to: All courts and attorneys of record on the attached Service List, this \_\_\_\_\_\_ of October, 2005.

### **CERTIFICATE OF FILING**

Steve I. Silverman

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been mailed to the clerk of each district court in which an action is pending that will be affected by the Motion.

Steve I. Silverman

#### Schedule A

Natalie Belmont, Sharon Berenfeld, M.D., Monica Martucci, Nicole M. Suri, Mirna Hormechea, Janet Brill, Ph.D., Sylvia Moss, Lewis Estevez, Melissa Zacharias, Ignacio Martinez, Rick Romash, Briditte Romash, Lillian Chasin and Carmen Finol v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 05-21921, U.S.D.C. S.D. Fla. (Gold, J.);

Kathleen Margay and Dorie Talotta v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 2:05-CV-4049, U.S.D.C. E.D. Pa. (Katz, J.);

<u>Lisa Howe, Melissa Ochiro, Dianne Walton and Maria Sprowl v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. CV05-5488, U.S.D.C. C.D. Ca. (Pregerson, J.);</u>

Jerry Syntych, Belinda Luquetta, Theresa Scott, Ruth Garcia, Tracey R. Ferguson, John Bums, Monica Ceballos, Kimberly Cowart, Gary Swartz, Maria Quinteros, Ruby Black v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. H 05-2530, U.S.D.C. S.D. Tx. (Werlein, J.);

Susan E. Schnur v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 1: 05-CV-1818, U.S.D.C. N.D. Oh. (Polster, J.);

Rosemarie Compitello, Jeannie Triolo, Robin Belodoff, Gary Frechter, Gracie Triolo, and Betty Muehlgay v. E1 DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 05-CV6749, U.S.D.C. S.D.NY. (Casey, J.);

Sheldon B Lyke, Dorothy M. Jones and Romuald C. Warkomski v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 05-CV-4168, U.S.D.C. N.D. Ill. (Aspen, J.);

Constance A. Webb v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 2:05-CV-72923, U.S.D.C. E.D. Mi. (Edmunds, J.);

Susan R. Yoshioka v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 05-CV-1440, U.S.D.C. Co. (Figa, J.);

<u>Judy Levin v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company</u>, No. 05-11618-WGY, U.S.D.C. Ma. (Young, J.);

Heath Hutchison, Sima Granat, Ashley Granat, Kim Kraus, Joseph Bales, Betty Baird, Mike Kessler, Connie Matthews, Tina Stoggsdill, Mary Fritz v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 4-05-CV-01234-ERW, U.S.D.C. E.D. Mo. (Webber, J.); and

Melissa Lee Urch and Claire R. Brown v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 7: 05-CV-02438 U.S.D.C. S.C. (Harwell, J.).

#### Schedule B

## Related Actions Whose Plaintiffs Have Expressed No Position Regarding the Relief Sought

<u>Jennifer Hardee v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company</u>, No. 05-CV-1522, S.D. Cal. (Storms, M.J.); and

Janet R. Luett, Shellie Johnson, Michelle Bridgeman, Wendee Larson, Kari Elbert and Dixie Radke v. E.I. DuPont DeNemours & Company, No. 4:05-CV-00422, U.S.D.C. S.D. Ia. (Longstaff, J.).

### SERVICE LIST CLERKS OF COURT

Clerk of the Court United States District Court -Central District of California 312 North Spring Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

Clerk of the Court
United States District Court Southern District of Texas
5401 Bob Casey United States
Courthouse
414 Rusk Avenue
Houston, TX 77002

Clerk of the Court United States District Court -Northern District of Ohio 801 West Superior Avenue Cleveland, OH 44113

Clerk of the Court United States District Court -Southern District of New York 500 Pearl Street and 40 Centre Street New York, NY 10007-1312

Clerk of the Court United States District Court -Northern District of Illinois Everett McKinley Dirksen Building, 20th Floor 219 South Dearborn Street Chicago, IL 60604

Clerk of the Court United States District Court -Eastern District of Michigan 231 West Lafayette 5th Floor Detroit, MI 48226

Clerk of the Court United States District Court -Colorado Alfred A. Arraj United States Courthouse, Room A105 901 19th Street Denver, CO 80294-3589

Clerk of the Court United States District Court -Massachusetts Suite 200 2 Center Plaza Boston, MA 02108

Clerk of the Court United States District Court -Eastern District of Missouri 111 South 10th Street Suite 3.300 St. Louis, MO 63102

Clerk of the Court
United States District Court South Carolina
Matthew J. Perry Jr.
Courthouse
901 Richland Street
Columbia, SC 29201

Clerk of the Court United States District Court -Southern District of California 880 Front Street Suite 4290 San Diego, CA 92101-8900

Clerk of the Court United States District Court -S.D. Iowa 123 East Walnut Street, Room 300 P.O. Box 9344 Des Moines, IA 50306-9344

Clerk of the Court United States District Court – Southern District of Florida 301North Miami Avenue Miami, FL 33128

Clerk of the Court United States District Court Eastern Dist. of Pennsylvania 601 Market Street, Room 2609 Philadelphia, PA 19106-1797

### SERVICE LIST PLAINTIFFS' COUNSEL

|   |                           | ·   |
|---|---------------------------|---|
| Andres F. Quintana, Esq.                | Harold M. Hewell, Esq.    | Timothy R. Beyer, Esq.                              |
| Ervin Cohen & Jessup, LLP               | Hewell Law Firm A.P.C.    | Brownstein, Hyatt & Farber                          |
| 9401 Wilshire Boulevard                 | 1901 First Avenue         | 410 17 <sup>th</sup> Street, 22 <sup>nd</sup> Floor |
| 9 <sup>th</sup> Floor                   | Second Floor              | Denver, CO 80202                                    |
| Beverly Hills, CA 90212-2974            | San Diego, CA 92102       |   |
| Roy Oppenheim, Esq.                     | Carmen D. Caruso, Esq.    | Tom Shapiro, Esq.                                   |
| Oppenheim, Pilelsky, PA                 | Schwartz, Cooper          | Shapiro Haber & Urmy LLP                            |
| 2500 Weston Road, Suite 404             | Greenberger and Krauss    | 53 State Street                                     |
| Weston, FL. 33331                       | 180 North LaSalle Street  | Boston, MA 02109                                    |
|   | Chicago, IL 60601         |   |
| Michael L. Pitt, Esq.                   | Gary A. Growe, Esq.       | Curtis Trinko, Esq.                                 |
| Pitt, Dowty, McGehee, Mirer             | Blumenfeld Kaplan &       | Law Offices of Curtis V.                            |
| & Palmer, P.C.                          | Sandweiss, P.C.           | Trinko, LLP   |
| 117 West 4 <sup>th</sup> St., Suite 200 | 168 North Meramec Avenue  | 16 West 46 <sup>th</sup> – 7 <sup>th</sup> Floor    |
| Royal Oak, MI 48067                     | St. Louis, MO 63105       | New York, N.Y. 10036                                |
| Peter Weinberger, Esq.                  | Gary M. Smith, Esq.       | Don Foster, Esq.                                    |
| Spangenberg, Shibley &                  | Graham, McClelland,       | Klehr, Harison, Harvey,                             |
| Liber, LLP                              | Ransbottom, Co., LPA      | Branzburg & Ellers, LLP                             |
| 1900 east Ninth Street                  | 11 North Fourth Street    | 260 South Broad Street                              |
| 2400 National City Center               | Zanesville, OH 43701      | Philadelphia, PA 19102                              |
| Cleveland, OH 44111-3400                |                           |   |
| John T. Lay, Esq.                       | Gary Polland, Esq.        | Alan J. Kluger, Esq.                                |
| Ellis, Lawhorne & Sims, P.A.            | Gary Polland & Associates | Kluger, Peretz, Kaplan &                            |
| 1501 Main Street, 5 <sup>th</sup> Floor | 3411 Richmond Avenue      | Berlin, P.L.  |
| Columbia, S.C. 29201                    | Suite 770                 | 201 S. Biscayne Boulevard                           |
|   | Houston, TX 77046         | Miami Center, 17 <sup>th</sup> Floor                |
|   |                           | Miami, Florida 33131                                |
| Kimberley K. Baer, Esq.                 |                           |   |
| Wandro & Associates PC                  |                           |   |
| 2501 Grand Avenue, Suite B              |                           |   |
| Des Moines, IA 50312                    |                           |   |
|   |                           |   |

# SERVICE LIST DEFENDANT'S COUNSEL

| Deborah Y Jones, Esq. Weston Benshoof Rochefort Rubalcava & MacCuish 333 S Hope St, 16th FI Los Angeles, CA 90071-2901  James Phillip Dorr, Esq. Wildman, Harrold, Allen & Dixon 225 West Wacker Drive Suite 3000 Chicago, IL 60606-1229 Robin G. Weaver, Esq. Squire, Sanders & Dempsey 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304 Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. DLA Piper Rudnick Gray Cary 4365 Executive Drive Suite 1100 San Diego, CA 92121-2133 Gretchen Witte Kraemer, Esq. Whitfield & Eddy, PLC 317 Sixth Avenue, Suite 1200 Des Moines, IA 50309  Eric W. Sitarchuk, Esq. Spallard Spahr Andrews & Ingersoll 1735 MARKET ST 51ST FL Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  Andrew C. Schirmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400 Miami, FL 33131-4332  Matthew A Holian, Esq. DLA Piper Rudnick Gray Cary 4365 Executive Drive Suite 1100 San Diego, CA 92121-2133 Gretchen Witte Kraemer, Esq. Whitfield & Eddy, PLC 317 Sixth Avenue, Suite 1200 Des Moines, IA 50309  Denver, CO 80202 Sara P. Bryant, Esq. Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Turner Padget Graham and Laney PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Tool Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022  Detroit, MI 48226-3425  |                                   | T                            | T                              |
|--|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Rubalcava & MacCuish 333 S Hope St, 16th Fl Los Angeles, CA 90071-2901  James Phillip Dorr, Esq. Wildman, Harrold, Allen & Dixon 225 West Wacker Drive Suite 3000 Chicago, IL 60606-1229  Robin G. Weaver, Esq. Squire, Sanders & Dempsey 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304 Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 1000 San Diego, CA 92121-2133 Cretchen Witte Kraemer, Esq. Whitfield & Eddy, PLC 317 Sixth Avenue, Suite 1200 Des Moines, IA 50309  Palenchar & Scott-Colorado 1899 Wynkoop Street #800 Denver, CO 80202 Sara P. Bryant, Esq. Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  John Smith Wilkerson, III Turner Padget Graham and Laney PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022   | Deborah Y Jones, Esq.             | Matthew A Holian, Esq.       | Kaspar J. Stoffelmayr, Esq.    |
| 333 S Hope St, 16th Fl Los Angeles, CA 90071-2901  James Phillip Dorr, Esq. Wildman, Harrold, Allen & Dixon 225 West Wacker Drive Suite 3000 Chicago, IL 60606-1229 Robin G. Weaver, Esq. Squire, Sanders & Dempsey 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304 Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 1100 San Diego, CA 92121-2133  Gretchen Witte Kraemer, Esq. Whitfield & Eddy, PLC 317 Sixth Avenue, Suite 1200 Des Moines, IA 50309  Ballard Spahr Andrews & Ingersoll Laney PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022   |                                   | DLA Piper Rudnick Gray       |                                |
| Los Angeles, CA 90071-2901  James Phillip Dorr, Esq. Wildman, Harrold, Allen & Dixon  225 West Wacker Drive Suite 3000 Chicago, IL 60606-1229  Robin G. Weaver, Esq. Squire, Sanders & Dempsey 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304 Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Sqn. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 100 San Diego, CA 92121-2133  #800 Denver, CO 80202  Sara P. Bryant, Esq. Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Fire W. Sitarchuk, Esq. Bolien San Diego, CA 92121-2133  #800 Denver, CO 80202  Sara P. Bryant, Esq. Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Turner Padget Graham and Laney PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022  | Rubalcava & MacCuish              | , ,                          | Palenchar & Scott- Colorado    |
| San Diego, CA 92121-2133  Jenver, CO 80202  James Phillip Dorr, Esq. Wildman, Harrold, Allen & Dixon 225 West Wacker Drive Suite 3000 Chicago, IL 60606-1229 Robin G. Weaver, Esq. Squire, Sanders & Dempsey 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304 Cleveland, OH 44114-1304 Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  Sara P. Bryant, Esq. Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Sara P. Bryant, Esq. Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Sara P. Bryant, Esq. Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Sara P. Bryant, Esq. Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Andrew S. Brick High Street Boston, MA 02130  Sara P. Bryant, Esq. Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Turner Padget Graham and Laney PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022   | 333 S Hope St, 16th Fl            | 4365 Executive Drive         | 1899 Wynkoop Street            |
| James Phillip Dorr, Esq. Wildman, Harrold, Allen & Dixon 225 West Wacker Drive Suite 3000 Chicago, IL 60606-1229 Robin G. Weaver, Esq. 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304 Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  Gretchen Witte Kraemer, Esq. Whitfield & Eddy, PLC 317 Sixth Avenue, Suite 1200 Des Moines, IA 50309  Bara P. Bryant, Esq. Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Turner Padget Graham and Laney PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022  | Los Angeles, CA 90071-2901        | Suite 1100                   | #800                           |
| Wildman, Harrold, Allen & Dixon  225 West Wacker Drive Suite 3000 Chicago, IL 60606-1229  Robin G. Weaver, Esq. Squire, Sanders & Dempsey 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304  Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002  Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 3009  Whitfield & Eddy, PLC 317 Sixth Avenue, Suite 1200 Des Moines, IA 50309  Boston, MA 02130  Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Alanna C. Rutherson, III Turner Padget Graham and Laney PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022  Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  Murtha Cullina LLP 99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  |                                   | San Diego, CA 92121-2133     | Denver, CO 80202               |
| Dixon  225 West Wacker Drive Suite 3000 Chicago, IL 60606-1229  Robin G. Weaver, Esq. Squire, Sanders & Dempsey 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304 Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  Eric W. Sitarchuk, Esq. Ballard Spahr Andrews & Ingersoll 1735 MARKET ST 51ST FL Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599 Kathleen A. Lang Dickinson Wright (Detroit) 500 Woodward Avenue Suite 4000 Detroit, MI 48226-3425  99 High Street Boston, MA 02130  John Smith Wilkerson, III Turner Padget Graham and Laney PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022   | James Phillip Dorr, Esq.          | Gretchen Witte Kraemer, Esq. | Sara P. Bryant, Esq.           |
| 225 West Wacker Drive Suite 3000 Chicago, IL 60606-1229  Robin G. Weaver, Esq. Squire, Sanders & Dempsey 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304 Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 4000  Des Moines, IA 50309  Boston, MA 02130  Alonn Smith Wilkerson, III Turner Padget Graham and Laney PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022  | Wildman, Harrold, Allen &         | Whitfield & Eddy, PLC        | Murtha Cullina LLP             |
| Suite 3000 Chicago, IL 60606-1229  Robin G. Weaver, Esq. Squire, Sanders & Dempsey 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304 Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  Eric W. Sitarchuk, Esq. Ballard Spahr Andrews & Ingersoll Inge | Dixon                             | 317 Sixth Avenue, Suite 1200 | 99 High Street                 |
| Chicago, IL 60606-1229  Robin G. Weaver, Esq. Squire, Sanders & Dempsey 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304  Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002  Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  Eric W. Sitarchuk, Esq. Ballard Spahr Andrews & Ingersoll IAnney PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022  | 225 West Wacker Drive             | Des Moines, IA 50309         | Boston, MA 02130               |
| Robin G. Weaver, Esq. Squire, Sanders & Dempsey 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304 Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  Eric W. Sitarchuk, Esq. Ballard Spahr Andrews & Ingersoll Turner Padget Graham and Laney PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129 Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022  | Suite 3000                        |                              |                                |
| Squire, Sanders & Dempsey 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304  Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  Ballard Spahr Andrews & Ingersoll 1735 MARKET ST 51ST FL Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  Kathleen A. Lang Dickinson Wright (Detroit) 500 Woodward Avenue Suite 4000 Detroit, MI 48226-3425  Turner Padget Graham and Laney PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022  | Chicago, IL 60606-1229            |                              |                                |
| 4900 Key Tower 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304  Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  Ingersoll 1735 MARKET ST 51ST FL Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  Kathleen A. Lang Dickinson Wright (Detroit) 500 Woodward Avenue Suite 4000 Detroit, MI 48226-3425  Detroit, MI 48226-3425  Laney PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022   | Robin G. Weaver, Esq.             | Eric W. Sitarchuk, Esq.      | John Smith Wilkerson, III      |
| 127 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-1304  Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002  Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  1735 MARKET ST 51ST FL Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  Kathleen A. Lang Dickinson Wright (Detroit) 500 Woodward Avenue Suite 4000 Detroit, MI 48226-3425  PO Box 22129 Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022   | Squire, Sanders & Dempsey         | Ballard Spahr Andrews &      | Turner Padget Graham and       |
| Cleveland, OH 44114-1304  Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002  Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 4000  S1ST FL Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  Kathleen A. Lang Dickinson Wright (Detroit) 500 Woodward Avenue Suite 4000 Detroit, MI 48226-3425  Charleston, SC 29413-2129  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022   | 4900 Key Tower                    | Ingersoll                    | Laney                          |
| Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  Kathleen A. Lang Dickinson Wright (Detroit) 500 Woodward Avenue Suite 4000 Detroit, MI 48226-3425  Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002  Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400   | 127 Public Square                 | 1735 MARKET ST               | PO Box 22129                   |
| Andrew C. Schirmeister III, Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 4000  Esq. Dickinson Wright (Detroit) 500 Woodward Avenue Suite 4000 Detroit, MI 48226-3425  Detroit, MI 48226-3425  Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq. Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022  | Cleveland, OH 44114-1304          | 51ST FL                      | Charleston, SC 29413-2129      |
| Esq. Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002 Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  Dickinson Wright (Detroit) 500 Woodward Avenue Suite 4000 Detroit, MI 48226-3425  Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP 570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022  |                                   | Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599  |                                |
| Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002  Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022  For a standard Avenue New York, NY 10022  Some Standard Avenue New York, NY 10022  | Andrew C. Schirmeister III,       | Kathleen A. Lang             | Alanna C. Rutherford, Esq.     |
| Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia Brem, LLP Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002  Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  570 Lexington Avenue New York, NY 10022  For a state of the state of th | Esq.                              | Dickinson Wright (Detroit)   | Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP |
| Pennzoil Place, North Tower 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002  Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  | Schirrmeister Diaz-Arrastia       | 500 Woodward Avenue          | 570 Lexington Avenue           |
| 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Houston, TX 77002  Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  | Brem, LLP                         | Suite 4000                   | New York, NY 10022             |
| Houston, TX 77002  Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400  | Pennzoil Place, North Tower       | Detroit, MI 48226-3425       |                                |
| Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400   | 700 Milam, 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor | ·                            |                                |
| Edward A. Moss Shook Hardy & Bacon 201 S Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2400   | i ·                               |                              |                                |
| 201 S Biscayne Boulevard<br>Suite 2400   |                                   |                              |                                |
| Suite 2400   | Shook Hardy & Bacon               |                              |                                |
| Suite 2400   | 201 S Biscayne Boulevard          |                              | ļ                              |
| Miami, FL 33131-4332   |                                   |                              |                                |
|  | Miami, FL 33131-4332              |                              |                                |